

MEETING MINUTES OF PROJECT STEERING COMMITTEE (PSC)

Sapa, 10 December 2007

MEETING OBJECTIVES

1. Summarizing, evaluating the project outputs achieved during the year of 2007
2. Preparing work plan and budget for 2008
3. Others

PARTICIPANTS

No	Name	Work place	Position
1	Hoang Ngoc	Department of Foreign Affairs and Border of Lai Chau province	Director of Department of Foreign Affairs and Border (DOFA); Head of the PSC
2	Ly Anh Hu	People's Committee (PC) of Muong Te district	Vice chairman of PC of the district; Head of Project Management Unit (PMU)
3	Tong Van Bac	Health Center of Muong Te district	Director of Health Center of the district Vice of PMU
4	Ha Duc Son	Department of Education of Muong Te district	Director of Department of Education of the district Vice of PMU
5	Ly Lu Ha	Department of Health of Muong Te district	Director of Department of Health of the district
6	Do Van Khai	Health Center of Muong Te district	Officer of Health Center of the district Project accountant
7	Tran Tuan Long	Department of Education of the district	Officer of Department of Education of the district Project accountant
8	Nguyen Van Duong	Department of Education of the district	Officer of Department of Education of the district
9	Hoang Van Phan	PC of Bum Nua commune	Chairman of communal PC
10	No Pu Me	PC of Pa Ve Su commune	Chairman of the communal PC
11	Agneta Dau Valler	CWS	Interim Representative
12	Ngo Quoc Dung	CWS	Programme Manager
13	Nguyen Van Ty	CWS	Watsan Officer
14	Nguyen Thi Hai Yen	CWS	Project Officer
15	Hoang Van Truong	CWS	Project Assistant

DISCUSSIONS:

1. Opening speech given by Mr. Hoang Ngoc, Head of the PSC

- We highly appreciate the supports provided by CWS during the 2-year implementation of the project in Muong Te district (duration 2006-2007). The project's implementation approaches are professional and strictly in compliance with the Government's rules and regulations. The project also built a PSC and a PMU right from the beginning, which also ensures the effectiveness of the project implementation.
- The effectiveness of the project is proved by the construction works, commissioned project activities which were put into practice by 2 implementing agencies/ institutions which are Health Center and Department of Education of the district.
- CWS also maintain close and synchronized coordination with DOFA as well as the PC of the district, in order to ensure that the development of the project meets the local needs and direction for development.
- However, during the process of carrying out the project there still remain difficulties, objective and subjective limitations which will be specifically mentioned in the evaluation reports of the PMU of Health project, PMU of Education project.

2. Report of Health PMU on implementation of the project in the year of 2007

- **Construction of classrooms for conducting training courses for new nurses for villages and upgrading the district Health Center's toilets.**

Remaining issues	Solutions
The process of checking/ inspection of documents is very slow even when the construction work has been commissioned for a long time, which influences the liquidation of the construction project	The project may employ a short-term independent consultant from the province or anywhere to check/inspect these financial documents. The PC of the district will decide on the approval based on inspection report provided by the consultant
Mr. Quan's team has neither completed the financial documents nor fixed the remaining broken parts of construction works.	The district's PMU will remind the team before 15/12 regarding this problem. If the team could not complete the work, the remaining amount will be spent to employ another team to fix them.
Mr. Hung's team has not submitted the receipts to the project.	In the PSC meeting, Mr. Hung's team informed that the receipts had been issued and would send to the PMU of the Health project in this week.

- **The construction of hygienic latrines for households**

- Achieved results: This activity has, up to now, been carried out for more than 1 year in 2 phases with 70 households of 5 villages in Bum Nua commune provided with hygienic latrines. However, all of these 70 households are from Thai minority. Currently the project is carried on its third phase and will tentatively come to an end in January 2008.
- Although the activity's development is facing many difficulties; it is one of those activities that receive supports from local people. However, there are some technical problems (high steps for children, small water pipes ...) that need improving.

- During September 2007, the PMU of Health project had conducted a review, evaluation on the construction of hygienic latrines for households. The evaluation report was completed and presented in the PSC meeting and shared among the relevant partners and agencies.
 - Comments and recommendations: In 2008, the PMU of Health project should not only continue conducting this activity in the villages of Thai minority with large and concentrating population, but also pay attention to its expansion to other communes and villages of ethnic minorities such as Ha Nhi, La Hu, Mang... with scattered households who have less needs, thus being more difficult to access. Therefore, communication, awareness raising activities on personal hygiene, environmental hygiene should be concerned about. According to Ms. Lo Pu Me, chairwoman of PC of Pa Ve Su commune, the construction of hygienic latrines for households is one of the increasing needs of the local people in my commune.
- **Training courses for new nurses for villages**
- The first phase of conducting training courses for new nurses has been completed in June 2007. Among 25 trainees, only 21 graduated and officially recognized by the PC of the district, and have started their work as nurses in the villages. The reason for trainees to have dropped out in the middle is their migration or the difficult situations of their families which prevent them from living far from home for a long time.
 - The continuity of developing the training for new nurses for villages remains necessary and needs implementing soon. During the second phase of the project, lessons learnt from the first phase can be applied in all processes from selecting trainees, organization to syllabus, thus the project will be more effective. However, due to changes in consuming price, the PMU would like to propose CWS to consider increasing the monthly meal support for each trainee.
- **Health check Day**
- During 2007, the Health check Day was organized for local people in 2 villages of Na Phay (Bum Nua) and Nam Xa (Bum To) by the PMU of Health project. This activity attracted the local people's participation and was highly appreciated, thus should be continued being implemented in 2008.
 - Like the activity of conducting trainings for new nurses for villages, the PMU of the Health project would like to propose CWS to consider increasing fees for buying medicines in the following Health check Days.

3. Report of Education PMU on implementation of the project in the year of 2007

Activities and remaining issues	Solutions
The construction of hygienic latrines for Na He kindergarten (KD): Currently the construction works have been completed but there still remain problems regarding the water supply due to changes in the project on water supply in the villages. As the result, construction works have not been utilized yet.	The project should not wait for Danida's project any longer. In the beginning of 2008, CWS together with PMU will conduct a field survey for water source in order to establish a specific water supply for the school.
The construction of 4 classrooms for Na He KD and Na He junior secondary school (JSS): completed and put into use.	

The construction of 2 classrooms for KD in Huoi Han village: completed and put into use	
The construction of classroom, teachers' rooms, kitchens for KDs in Phin Kho village: completed and put into use	
The construction of new hygienic latrines for the JSS of Phin Kho village: completed and put into use	
Providing teaching and studying equipments and facilities (table, chairs, units, organs, cassette, teaching tools, toys...) and following up as well as providing health care to school children: completed and put into use	In some places, there is still limited electricity to run cassettes but teachers had spent a part of their salaries to purchase batteries for using.
Supports for light lunches in KD (expanded in 14 villages) and supports for rice for children of JSS are continue to be carried out	
Training on La Hu ethnic minority language: the edition of training manual and the pilot training course for teachers of KD and primary school (PS) as well as health workers are completed.	PMU will coordinate comments and recommendations from the pilot training to finalize the training manual and curriculum preparing for following training series in 2008.

For more specific details of project activities, please refer to the Diary of the PSC meeting provided to every participant.

Other comments and recommendations:

- During the implementation of the project, the PMU of Education project may suggest activities to respond to the new principles regarding standardization in education.
- The provision of training courses on music instruments or painting should be considered whether it is necessary or in compliance with the current syllabus in schools.
- Besides capacity building for teachers, there are still some limitations due to variable and changing teacher staff, and upgrading school facilities remains a big issue of Muong Te district which needs paying attention to.

4. Financial statement on the project from the beginning to Quarter III, 2007 and sharing audit reports

- Based on quarterly reports of 2 PMUs of Health project and Education project, CWS has prepared quarterly financial statements and project budget balance sheets to orderly submit to 2 PMUs. At the time of the meeting of the PSC, the project is still in its quarter IV, 2007 thus its financial statement is only due on 30/9/2007. For further specific details, please kindly refer to the Diary of the PSC meeting which was delivered to every participant.
- Although the audit report is not officially sent to CWS by the auditing institute, there are some comments given by audit officers while working with project accountants

and from their field trips such as: lack of receipts from Ministry of Finance (Mr. Hung's team); properties inventory book with discontinuous records from the beginning of the project through years and without record of 2006 (Bum To KD); unstamped adjacent pages of contracts; receipts without mentioning "Paid by CWS"...

5. Extension and continuity of the project

- In the PSC meeting dated 6/6/2007, it was proposed to DOFA by Mr. Ly Anh Hu, Vice chairman of PC of Muong Te district, head of the PMU and CWS that there should be project extension and continuity.
- In this PSC meeting, CWS informed about the approval for expansion of the project to Pa Ve Su commune and extension of the project to 2010. However, CWS still waits for the approval from Lai Chau provincial PC regarding this issue to ensure the organization's abidance by Government's rules and regulations.
- Mr. Hoang Ngoc, Director of DOFA of Lai Chau province, Head of PSC, verbally approved the expansion and extension of the project, and also asked the PC of Muong Te district to send the proposal to DOFA to work with provincial PC on the approval.

6. Project Work plan for 2008

- Partners including PC at district level and DOFA shared their information with CWS on other projects carried out in Lai Chau in order to achieve a good coordination and avoid overlaps in the work, thus support resources can be utilized for the locality. According to them, besides CWS, there are currently 2 other NGOs who are Minor and Global Care providing direct supports such as blankets, coats, ... in Muong Te but there is no overlap at the communal level. Other projects of PEDC, SNV, Danida, ... and those of CWS are also not overlapped
- CWS informed the PSC and PMU about the planned budget for 2008 of 4 billions VND, of which 1,43 billions VND is the balance due from 2006, 2007 and unplanned amount that will be carried forward to 2008 (please refer to the Project Financial statement and budget balance sheet), and 2,57 billions VND is the amount that will be newly allocated for project activities in 2008.
- Based on the total budget of 4 billions VND for the year of 2008, the PSC, the PMU of Health project, PMU of Education project and CWS discussed on the main activities under each project objective. However, this list of project activities for 2008 is only tentative for now. Early in January 2008, CWS will cooperate with the Health and Education PMUs and with beneficiary institutions and communities to conduct detailed surveys, consider priorities to complete the List of Project activities for 2008.




7. Other comments and follow-up activities:

- Ms Agneta, CWS, noted that the year of 2008 was identified by United Nations as a time to focus in Hygienic issues, which was according to the UN's Millennium Development Goals in which Vietnam was a committed member. Therefore, in 2008, she recommended that the project should also focus in the issue of hygienic water and sanitation; promote health care activities as well as communications on this issue.
- Mr. Hoang Ngoc, head of the PSC recommended that in 2008, the project should review the spending/disbursement process, particularly development activities, in order to push the project implementing progress and ensure the effectiveness of the project for project beneficiaries. The PMU should review and select the reliable work team as well as design clear principles and commitments to ensure construction procedures be followed properly and strictly.

- Mr. Ly Anh Hu, Head of the PMU suggested a solution of employing consultants with full legal status and proper profession to inspect the project financial estimates and liquidations, which would push the project development as well as project spending/disbursement.
- After the PSC meeting, the PC at district level should send a proposal for project expansion and extension to the DOFA soon to present before the provincial PC for official approval accordingly.
- The need assessment should be conducted soon in 1/2008 as mentioned above in order to complete the List of Project activities for the year of 2008.
- The next PSC meeting should be organized in Muong Te so that we could integrate field visits for relevant partners.

8. Meeting evaluation:

The general evaluation of the PSC meeting is shown as following:

 12/15 (80%)	 3/15 (20%)	 0 (0%)
---	--	--

The meeting closed at 12h30 on the same day.

This meeting minute is prepared by CWS and will be shared with relevant partners including PSC, PMU of Health project and PMU of Education project.